

13-Dec-2019

BMJ-2019-052342.R1

Trends and risk factors of mortality and disability-adjusted life year for chronic respiratory diseases from 1990 to 2017

Dear Dr. Li

Thank you for sending us the revised version of your paper. We recognise its potential importance and relevance to general medical readers, but we think there are a few minor points that need clarifying, as detailed in the report from our statistician.

In addition, I noticed that, following a reviewer's suggestion, you switched the term 'uncertainty intervals' to 'confidence intervals'. You argue the use of uncertainty intervals in this context but switch to confidence intervals to satisfy the reviewer comment. We have been pondering the issue and would prefer that you go back to 'uncertainty intervals' because you produce the intervals from the percentiles of the distribution drawn. The interpretation is the same.

When you return your revised manuscript, please note that The BMJ requires an ORCID ID for corresponding authors of all research articles. If you do not have an ORCID ID, registration is free and takes a matter of seconds.

Yours sincerely,

Jose Merino
Dr Jose Merino
US Research Editor
jmerino@bmj.com

Comments from the statistician

This is an improvement on the original version and all my comments have been addressed. While the heat maps are visually good to look at, the addition of the numerical results for each of the countries is a welcome addition for global readers in Supplementary Table 3. The results are however presented as estimate, UCI, LCI. It would seem more natural to present the LCI followed by UCI.

I do feel as though the article would still benefit from editorial oversight from a copy editor. There are a number of grammatical errors. From a stats view, P value should be p-value. I would also not include '=' for results - I would marry the results in line with the text. Also please make it clear what the units are when talking about all results, e.g. add that it is a percentage if that is what it is.

Additional Questions:

The BMJ uses compulsory open peer review. Your name and institution will be included with your comments when they are sent to the authors. If the manuscript is accepted, your review, name and institution will be published alongside the article.

If this manuscript is rejected from The BMJ, it may be transferred to another BMJ journal along with your reviewer comments. If the article is selected for publication in another BMJ journal, depending on the editorial policy of the journal your review may also be published. You will be contacted for your permission before this happens.

For more information, please see our peer review terms and conditions.

Please confirm that you understand and consent to the above terms and conditions.: I consent to the publication of this review

Please enter your name: Jamie Kirkham

Job Title: Professor of Biostatistics

Institution: University of Manchester

Reimbursement for attending a symposium?: No

A fee for speaking?: No

A fee for organising education?: No

Funds for research?: No

Funds for a member of staff?: No

Fees for consulting?: No

Have you in the past five years been employed by an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this paper?: No

Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this paper?: No

If you have any competing interests (please see BMJ policy) please declare them here: